



Strengthening Women's Political Participation and Leadership for Effective Democratic Governance in Pakistan

FINAL EVALUATION REPORT

MARCH 2016

MOHSIN NAZIR SURANI

CONTENTS

| | |
|--|----|
| Acronyms..... | 2 |
| 1. Project Objectives..... | 8 |
| 2. Evaluation Objectives | 11 |
| 3. Methodological Approach..... | 11 |
| 3.1. Phasing..... | 11 |
| 3.2. Data collection and sources of information..... | 13 |
| 3.3. Evaluation Design..... | 13 |
| 3.4. Main aspects of verification..... | 13 |
| 3.5. Evaluation Matrix..... | 14 |
| 4. Evaluation findings | 18 |
| 5. Conclusions and Recommendations: | 29 |
| 6. Annexes | |

ACRONYMS

| | |
|------|--|
| WILL | Women’s Initiative for Learning and Leadership |
| SFCG | Search for Common Ground |
| CGA | Common Ground Approach |
| TOC | Theory of Change |
| MEAL | Monitoring, Evaluation Accountability and Learning |
| BL | Base line |
| TNA | Training Needs Assessment |
| TOT | Training of Trainers |
| FGDs | Focused Group Discussions |
| DAC | Development Assistance Criteria |
| KP | Khyber Pakhtunkhwa |
| IF | Insan Foundation |
| MQM | Muttahida Qaumi Movement |
| MPA | Member of Provincial Assembly |
| SOW | Scope of work |
| TOR | Terms of Reference |

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

In September 2013, Search for Common Ground (SFCG) was awarded a grant by the US State Department to support current women parliamentarians (at both national and provincial levels) and aspiring women councillors (local level) under the Women's Initiative for Leadership & Learning (WILL): Strengthening Women Parliamentarians in Pakistan for Effective Government. The overall project goal was to strengthen the role of women parliamentarians in the Provincial Assemblies in a way that increases their influence in decision-making for effective governance.

As a struggling young democracy, ensuring the representation of women at all decision-making levels in national, regional, and international institutions and mechanisms for the prevention, management, and resolution of conflict in Pakistan has been vital. Unfortunately, women do not command a significant presence in the legislative, executive, or judicial spheres. As a result, they have little influence in the decision-making processes. The results of Pakistan's 2013 elections, after the Pakistan People's Party (PPP)-led government's five-year term, highlighted the need to support women legislators. The elections marked an increase in women's participation in mainstream politics. Not only did more women run than ever before, a total of 214 women were elected to both Parliament and the Provincial Assemblies.¹ These women are crucial to peace and development, yet they are often absent at negotiation tables. We recognised the importance of working with such women to help create more inclusive policies to tackle issues of peace, security, and development.

Compared to many other countries, Pakistan has a high level of women's representation in governing bodies, currently ranking 49th in the world. Yet this numerical strength has not translated into women having decision-making power nor serving as key policymakers.² In 2000, Pakistan adopted a gender quota policy under the Devolution of Power Plan in order to facilitate women's representation in local, provincial, and national politics. Under the policy, 33% of seats in local government and 17% of seats in the national and provincial assemblies are reserved for women. These reserved seats are allocated through indirect election. During general elections, each party submits two lists of women candidates in each province, one for the National and one for the Provisional Assembly. Women are awarded seats in proportion to the number of general seats secured by their political party in each respective assembly. This indirect system for electing female candidates makes them dependent on the goodwill of their colleagues and parties in order to be elected. It is for this reason, among others, that the Pakistani women's movement is demanding direct election of women on reserved seats.

¹ Aqeel, Naureen. "Women Parliamentarians: Catalysts for Change". *The Express Tribune*. 25 May 2010.

² Bano, Saira. "Women in Parliament in Pakistan: Problems and Potential Solutions." *Women's Studies Journal* 23.1 (2009): 19-35. Web.

Most elected women parliamentarians continue to face other issues that prevent them from gaining influence at the institutional level. The majority of female parliamentarians have been elected for the first-time³: they lack confidence, relevant parliamentary experience, and basic knowledge and skills in legislative work. As a result, women have not been able to forge effective alliances, networks, and linkages with stakeholders inside and outside parliament. Furthermore, as in many countries, politics in Pakistan is male-dominated, with men controlling the legislative agenda. Female party members are not assigned decision-making positions within their own parties and are actively marginalised by male peers. Due to such hindrances, women parliamentarians struggle to represent the interests of women and other constituencies, and find it difficult to effectively articulate progressive policy agendas.

This final evaluation was designed to assess the overall approach of the project, using a “theory-based evaluation” framework. The evaluation seeks to first identify the project’s implicit theory of change, assess its logic, relevance, and effectiveness. Additionally, the evaluation measured how the project was implemented and the extent to which project goals and objectives were achieved.

The evaluation found that the majority of project beneficiaries benefitted from the content delivered through the various capacity building programs. Of a total of 128 MPAs, the project trained 64%, which is 23.7% of those in Punjab, 53% of those in Sindh, 52% of those in Baluchistan and 69% of those in KP. This can be considered a “critical mass” of women MPAs who have been exposed to the project’s ideas and who have made commitments to the objectives of strengthening women leaders’ voices. Politicians shared that the content was both relevant and practical to their work. Sixty six percent of the respondents appreciated that the program helped bring all major parties together. Leaders from across party lines had the opportunity to sit together to discuss and learn together – something that was rare for them.

Furthermore, following in the footsteps of the women’s caucus at the federal level initiated by Fehmida Mirza, former Speaker of the National Assembly, women caucuses have been established at the provincial level with senior parliamentarians taking interest in the role that the caucus can play over. Members of both the Punjab and Sindh caucuses have been part of SFCG’s WILL program either as participants or guest speakers. During the provincial level trainings in Punjab, MPAs and MNAs representing their respective women caucuses had the opportunity to engage in discussions on how they could better utilize the platform to further women related issues provincially and nationally. They commented on how the training was a rare opportunity for so many of them to be under one roof outside of the Assembly to be able

³ Role and Performance Assessment of Pakistani Women Parliamentarians 2002-2007, pp.83

to discuss issues. Shehla Raza, the Deputy Speaker, and the chair of the Sindh Women's Parliamentary Caucus has been very supportive of the WILL program in the province.

The Punjab Assembly recently approved the bill for protection of women against violence. Although there are a lot of improvements that could be made to strengthen the bill, this has been a huge achievement for all those individuals and organisations that have spent years advocating for this. The Punjab Women's Parliamentary Caucus is focusing on reviewing existing legislation particularly related to the protection of the rights of women and I am watching closely to see how far they will progress.

EVALUATION OBJECTIVES

The Final Evaluation was designed to assess the overall approach of the project, using a “theory-based evaluation” framework. The evaluation seeks to first identify the project’s implicit theory of change, assess its logic, relevance, and effectiveness. Additionally, the evaluation measured how the project was implemented and the extent to which project goals and objectives were achieved.

EVALUATION DESIGN

A non-experimental design was proposed for this evaluation as no counterfactuals had been selected by the project for comparison purpose. Interviews with SFCG and key informants and review of literature were conducted in Islamabad. Thirty training participants have been selected from the total while 10 interviews have been administered with SFCG and partners’ staff. Criteria for selection has been agreed jointly with SFCG.

Instruments for data collection for each information source were developed and agreed upon with SFCG. The instruments were adjusted after seeking feedback from the Country and regional technical team.

KEY FINDINGS

RELEVANCE

- More than sixty percent of the training participants shared that the program was relevant and it has given them a great sense of awareness as well as relevant information. Moreover, fifty four percent women respondents (training participants) shared that this program has improved their leadership skills. The coaching activities can be said to have been relevant to the beneficiaries’ needs for information (for example on leadership qualities) and support (for example, when they encountered conflicts and wanted to discuss ways to resolve problems).

- Only six respondents had taken advantage of the coaching sessions (although in the course of the project the Insan Foundation Trust and PAIMAN both conducted 120 sessions (totaling 240 sessions). The women who had participated in the coaching sessions responded that they were very appreciative of the fact that the coaching was available and said that they had found it useful.
- The program's structure provided an opportunity to the women's leaders, parliamentarians, councilors and others to interact with each other, with other parties and with the media and community. This opportunity however had been limited before the project, leaving them unable to respond to queries or to contact the media themselves.

EFFICIENCY

- Selection criteria for political parties were open and all mainstream political parties were selected. There were clearly inclusion and exclusion errors.
- The SFCG Pakistan Finance team supported partners in strengthening their financial systems for this project and aligning those systems with each other so that all partners could report efficiently. SFCG Pakistan thus functioned as a helpful and effective "bridge" between SFCG, the partners and DRL.
- The biggest factor that had to be addressed by the project team was the timing of political events: primarily the May 2013 General Election, which preoccupied those women running for office as MPAs. The security situation (i.e. suicide bombings and target killings) made it difficult for participants to attend some events and often, politicians were the targets of these attacks (e.g. as noted in the *Uks* Fourth Quarterly Report). Several MPAs included in the mid-term evaluation noted that their parties' demands on their time – and their election campaigns - had to take precedence over project activities.
- The partners and some of the Master Trainers felt that more inter-partner meetings at the inception stage would have enabled them to know each other better and to acquire deeper understanding of the aspects of the project. The partners' participation in consortium meetings and the initiative was rather inconsistent, which led to some issues in co-ordination and less than ideal cross-the-board co-operation.

EFFECTIVENESS

- Of a total of 128 MPAs, the project trained 64%, which is 23.7% of those in Punjab, 53% of those in Sindh, 52% of those in Baluchistan and 69% of those in KP. This can be considered a "critical mass" of women MPAs who have been exposed to the project's ideas and who have made commitments to the objectives of strengthening women leaders' voices.
- Majority of the training participants shared that trainings had added to their previous knowledge, the respondents, without exception, agreed that the trainings and leadership forums had enhanced their knowledge, especially in conflict resolution and in their capacity

to interact with the media. A Master Trainer who had attended the ToT termed both the trainer and the contents of the training “excellent”. The other Trainers (50% of them) were also positive in their assessment.

- In Karachi, forty percent of the participants mentioned that they are now able to interact with the police, which is an indication of their empowerment, as it links them to the legal system. The movement from inability to ability, with its attendant concept of entitlement, is significant for all of the women, especially since some of the ex-Councilors are not literate.
- Three out of thirty women noted that they must deal with the fact that there is a tribal and feudal society and that these factors limit their ability to function as politicians. They found the “group activities and learning opportunities to be excellent”, and felt the training had strengthened their determination to overcome these difficulties.

IMPACT

- Sixty six percent of the women respondents from different political parties shared that in addition to enhancing their learning, WILL has brought major political parties together and now we can see a great culture of inclusiveness among the parties.⁴
- The WILL campaign that grew in the second phase of the project also contributed to ensuring that the learning continues. The video documentary was also shown in many political and social forums that carries the message that women politicians and leaders were willing and able to respond to constituents’ needs. The WILL Facebook page is also an excellent medium for raising issues pertaining to women and for sharing good practices.
- Interview respondents noted that a number of prominent politicians are WILL ambassadors, including the Honorable former Speaker of the House. Ample knowledge on the part of the project participants, especially at the District level, has yet to be achieved, in part because some of the women leaders do not use the Internet.

Program Background

In 2013, SFCG was awarded the two-year “Strengthening Women Parliamentarians in Pakistan for Effective Government” project by the U.S. State Department, Bureau of Democracy, Human Rights and Labor (DRL). This project was given the brand name WILL (Women’s Initiative for Learning and Leadership) by SFCG. SFCG along with its local partners including PAIMAN, UKs and Insan Foundation built the capacity of women political leaders and providing continued leadership development for current and former women parliamentarians at the provincial levels as well as politicians at the district level. Program trainings, coaching sessions, networking platforms and leadership forums aimed at increasing their capacity to build coalitions and

⁴ Analysis of consolidated Responses from the training participants

strategic consensus with likeminded individuals and organizations. The project also utilized popular media in an attempt to shift attitudes toward women's participation in government. Media activities included message development, stakeholder meetings, common ground workshops, developing and handling of publicity and promotion of a nationwide campaign, and interactive talk shows.

BUILDING ON WILL'S SUCCESSES ACHIEVED IN THE LAST TWO YEARS, SFCG BEGAN IMPLEMENTING THE SECOND PHASE OF WILL BEGINNING OCTOBER 2013. WILL's second phase aimed to strengthen the leadership capacities of women parliamentarians in the Provincial Assemblies, their male counterparts and government officials from Punjab and Sindh provinces in order to increase their influence in decision-making and effective governance. More specifically, it draws on SFCG's experience and networks in the Punjab and Sindh provinces, as well as on its global expertise in strengthening women's political leadership skills by supporting participants to develop and utilize skills in community mobilization, dialogue and negotiation, capacity building, and media engagement. It also harnesses its partners' locally rooted experience working with the target groups of the initiative. Through a multi-pronged approach, WILL engaged key stakeholders to shape national solidarity and establish mechanisms for greater participation of women in politics and policy-making. WILL aims to create a transformative experience of negotiation, collaboration, and effecting change for women leaders using SFCG's well-tested Common Ground Approach (CGA)⁵ that can translate their commitment to democratic governance in Pakistan through policy reform and implementation.

1. PROJECT OBJECTIVES:

The overall project goal is to strengthen the role of women parliamentarians in the Provincial Assemblies in a way that increases their influence in decision-making for effective governance.

Specific objectives include the following:

- To increase the leadership skills of women parliamentarians for effective policy-making and reform;
- To facilitate the creation of policy mechanisms that enable women parliamentarians to collaborate across party lines with their male counterparts and government officials; and

⁵The Common Ground Approach is a means of navigating through conflict and identifying possibilities that are not apparent from an adversarial mindset. It is a set of principles and practices that, when utilized, causes a fundamental shift in people's relationship with conflict--away from adversarial approaches toward cooperative solutions. The Common Ground Approach--whether applied in a home in the suburbs of New York City, on the streets of inner city Cincinnati, or between ethnic groups in the Balkans or Buner (FATA)--creates new possibilities of peaceful coexistence. The Common Ground Approach is derived from over three decades of practical experience--it has been crafted by what works.

- To build positive public perception around the role of women parliamentarians as effective leaders and decision-makers through media sensitization.

Theory of Change: This project is designed based on an interlocking set of theories of change and therefore evaluation also aims to assess the theory of change in geographical context of the Country.

- If women MPAs strengthen their leadership skills and confidence levels, they can increase their role in policy-making;
- If women MPs – supported by an enabling environment – proactively collaborate with each other across dividing lines and create mechanisms at all tiers for that collaboration which brings them into contact with their male counterparts and government officials, they can increase their influence in policymaking; and
- If the positive contributions of women leaders in policy-making are highlighted in the media, then the public perception of their role as effective leaders and decision-makers will increase.

In order to increase the capacity of women parliamentarians as well as former and aspiring women councilors by magnifying women’s voices and bolstering engagement in decision making at the provincial and local levels, the project set the following broader results.

- Elected women parliamentarians and former and aspiring women councilors are equipped with coalition and consensus building skills and are able to advocate more effectively for a variety of issues, including women specific issues;
- Trainers/facilitators from national women’s organizations are empowered as agents of reform and change and provide effective political leadership training at provincial and local levels in Pakistan;
- The population’s awareness and perception of the role of women politicians as effective decision-makers in government is improved.

Project Activities: The initiative consists of four specific phases, which are interlocking and build on one another. They include the following:

Phase I - Baseline and Political Needs Assessment on Women Parliamentarians: SFCG conducted a robust assessment to ensure that the project addresses some of the most pressing challenges and opportunities that women MPAs face in their ongoing efforts for political leadership. In addition to a full desk review of recent studies on women in national politics in Pakistan, SFCG measured the core attitudes of all relevant stakeholders towards women political leaders, particularly to identify issues and attitudes pertaining to them at provincial

and district levels. This is a crucial step in the project because the dynamics within each of the Provincial Assemblies from the previous has shifted dramatically as a result of the elections. Secondly, the study guided the implementing partners in the selection of participants and key secondary stakeholders such as provincial ministries, local civil servants, media figures, etc. The specific training and dialogue content also stem from the results of the baseline and needs assessment reports.

Phase II – Capacity-building/Leadership Development for Policy-making and Networking: The second phase of the project aimed to strengthen the capacities of women MPAs for policy consensus building and legislation, through a set of intensive training workshops. In addition to strengthening their leadership skills, participants were expected to increase their knowledge of parliamentary rules of business and legislative processes. The training phase comprised of the following specific activities:

- a. **Training Modules and Manuals:** Drawing from the baseline findings and political needs assessment, IFT and SFCG developed training modules and a manual for project beneficiaries.
- b. **Training of Trainers (ToT):** IFT planned a five-day ToT in Islamabad led by an international trainer from SFCG. SFCG also planned to train 10 master trainers (provincial trainers and partner staff) to take the lead in imparting trainings along with SFCG staff on leadership skills, advocacy, legislation, policymaking and women political friendly media reporting.
- c. **Provincial Trainings:** IFT planned 5 three-day trainings in Lahore (Punjab) and Karachi (Sindh), engaging 110 current and former local political figures from both provinces. Three trainings were to be organized in Punjab and two in Sindh, with each engaging approximately 22 representatives of various political parties.

Phase III – Stakeholder Dialogues to Create Collaborative Mechanisms in Provincial Assemblies: SFCG aimed to instigate a series of multi-stakeholder dialogues at the national and provincial levels to explore, facilitate, and establish mechanisms for collaboration among female and male MPAs for policy-making for governance. The partnership convened women politicians – with male allies and other relevant figures – into a process aimed at establishing agreement on specific priority policy areas and a means of collaboration on key policy initiatives. Through this facilitated engagement, participants had to identify any need for institutional mechanisms, such as provincial-level women’s caucuses, and ways to wield them as policy-making instruments. The series of stakeholder dialogues comprised of the following:

- a. **Provincial Policy Dialogues:** IFT arranged 2 one-day Provincial Policy Dialogues (1 in each province) in Lahore and Karachi, targeting 95 beneficiaries, including current and former MPAs and government officials. Punjab and Sindh had to host a 48-person Provincial Policy Dialogue where politicians who had to lead in forming, amending, debating or revising the

selected priority policy areas. Participants planned to debate provincial level issues and attempt to find agreeable solutions in two forums held in both provinces while also identifying areas for collaboration.

- b. National Dialogue Summit: Subsequent to Local and Provincial Policy Dialogues, IFT had to conduct a one-day National Dialogue Summit in Islamabad to discuss provincial issues and recommendations in a national forum.

Phase IV - Media Outreach and Communications for Positive Portrayal of and Support for Women Parliamentarians: Building on the success of the ongoing WILL campaign, SFCG and IFT planned to increase the visibility of women parliamentarians, positioning them as thought leaders and key to policy success in Pakistan, through the following media outreach and communication activities:

Multi-media Outreach Campaign: SFCG planned to leverage the successful creation of its WILL brand by extending the existing multi-media platforms to advance support and public awareness about the positive role women leaders are playing in Pakistan. By actively engaging with media professionals while also capitalizing on previous media relationships building from the current initiative, SFCG had to oversee the dissemination of a range of media outputs, including news and features content for television, radio, print and digital media.

2. EVALUATION OBJECTIVES

The Final Evaluation is designed to assess the overall approach of the project, using a “theory-based evaluation” framework. The evaluation will seek to first identify the project’s implicit theory of change, and assess its logic, relevance, and effectiveness. Additionally, the evaluation will measure how the project was implemented and to what extent the project goals and objectives were achieved. The evaluation will measure how well the project responded to the needs of women parliamentarians, ex-councilors and aspiring female politicians through an assessment of relevance; measure the project’s effectiveness by assessing how well it achieved its objectives, outcomes and outputs; evaluate the program’s design, strategy and implementation strategy; and finally assess the management of the program, including the management of relationships with partner organizations.

3. METHODOLOGICAL APPROACH

3.1. PHASING

The evaluation was implemented in three phases:

Preparatory (inception) phase

The preparatory phase encompassed:

- Preparation of data collection tools (questionnaires, discussion frameworks, and checklists) for gathering information from relevant partner organization, SFCG, participants of trainings, and other stakeholders.
- Gathering of information, review of secondary data – analysis of available data including quarterly reports; relevant legislation, project documentation, periodic project reports, financial reports and budget, strategic documents, and other relevant documents
- Speaking with key informants on the training program of female legislators to bring in views on the benefits and limitations of the approach from a global perspective.
- Consolidation and approval of the evaluation design by SFCG.
- Formulation of hypotheses related to the evaluation questions, based on the résumé of information and findings. These hypotheses were verified at a later stage of the evaluation.
- Preparation and presentation of the draft inception report to Search for Common Ground.
- Finalization of Inception report after having feedback from SFCG.

Field phase: The fieldwork was implemented in accordance with the agreed evaluation questions and methodology and in compliance with the objectives of the evaluation and expectations of the SFCG. Since most of the partners are not in contact with SFCG therefore key informant interviews will remain a major part of field exercise.

This phase encompassed:

- Detailed consultations were held with the SFCG team in Islamabad.
- Review of secondary data – including strategic plans, project reports, statistics, quarterly report, monitoring reports, monitoring reports from previous projects, reports from trainings and other relevant documents.
- Analysis of information and factors that contributed to successes and failures of training program.
- Identification and gathering of missing information.
- Verification of hypothesis formulated during the inception phase.
- Opening and closing briefings with SFCG.

During the final phase, the information from the preparatory and field phases was consolidated, processed, analyzed, and interpreted in relation to the evaluation questions. This phase encompassed:

- Analysis and synthesis of data provided by SFCG.
- Formulation of findings and conclusions.
- Drafting and submitting the evaluation report
- Processing comments from SFCG and preparing second draft.
- Processing comments from SCFG and preparing the final report.

3.2. DATA COLLECTION AND SOURCES OF INFORMATION

- Review of literature including the project proposal, implementation plan and studies done by different actors on trainings of female parliamentarians.
- Key informant interviews (KII) of the SFCG staff including but not limited to Executive director, project manager, Monitoring Evaluation Accountability and Learning officer, finance manager and others.
- Key informant interviews of partner's staff including but not limited to their director, manager, project coordinator and MEAL staff.
- Consultations with participants of the trainings (30 participants).

3.3. EVALUATION DESIGN

Interviews with SFCG and key informants and review of literature were conducted in Islamabad. A minimum of 30 training participants was selected from the total participants while 10 interviews were administered with SFCG and partner staff. Criteria for selection were jointly agreed with SFCG.

Instruments for data collection for each information source were developed and agreed upon with SFCG. The instruments have been adjusted after seeking feedback from Country and regional technical team. Information obtained during interviews with key informants has been entered in digital form during the interviews or transcribed from handwritten to digital versions. SCFG senior staff has held interviews with key informants.

Following transcription, the analysis process involved:

- Thorough review of transcripts and identifying relevant themes and sub themes.
- Organizing quotations with accompanying respondent information.
- The draft evaluation report was submitted to SFCG for comments and consultation by 20th February 2016.
- The final version of the evaluation report will be submitted to SFCG by 30th March 2016.

3.4. MAIN ASPECTS OF VERIFICATION

- How has the training approach impacted on the decision-making and practices of women parliamentarians in communities?
- How effective was training program in building the capacity of female local leaders to play their roles in creating the social change?
- How effective was the training program in supporting women parliamentarians to raise voices in local communities and parliament?
- Assess the project's operational efficiency in terms of cost-effectiveness and use of resources with added focus on the role of partners.
- Review and assess the institutional arrangement for the implementation of the programme; with the focus on roles and responsibilities of SFCG and partners.
- Review and assess the implementing local partners' capacity, efficiency, transparency on information management, coordination and their contribution.
- Evaluate the quality of programme monitoring and its role in improving program delivery.
- Evaluate the working relationship with the different government counterparts and key stakeholders and their ownership of the project with a view to assessing sustainability of the results.

3.5. EVALUATION MATRIX

The evaluation design in the table below includes the evaluation questions from section, related sub-questions, type of questions, evaluation design and techniques for gathering data.

The scale for rate of fulfilment of an evaluation criterion extends from 1 to 6:

- 1 – Very low (there are critical problems, the objectives cannot be reached, there are negative impacts)
- 2 – Low (in spite of significant problems or dissatisfaction the objectives are still partly achievable)
- 3 – Medium (the procedures, results or assumptions somewhat meet the expectations)
- 4 – Rather high (the intervention brings good results but there are negative external factors)
- 5 – High (the objectives are met and there is an overall satisfaction with the intervention)
- 6 – Very high (the objectives are fully met and the applied practices can be further disseminated)

In case there is not enough information, the conclusion can be “not applicable” or “irrelevant”, but such conclusion must be fully justified.

Non-experimental design is proposed for this evaluation mainly because no counterfactuals have been selected for comparison purpose.

| Question | Type | Design | Techniques |
|--|-------------|----------------------------|---|
| 1. Design and relevance | | | |
| 1.1.1. Are the project's stated goals and objectives relevant to the issues central to the women politicians in Pakistan? Do the activities and strategies fit project objectives? | Descriptive | Non-experimental, one-shot | KII, Training participants, partners lead |
| 1.1.2. Is the project adding value that other actors in peacebuilding and the media in Pakistan were not previously providing? | Descriptive | Non-experimental, one-shot | KII, Training participants, partners lead |
| 1.1.3. How relevant are the project strategies and activities as perceived by the beneficiaries and other community stakeholders? | Descriptive | Non-experimental, one-shot | KII, Training participants, partners lead |
| 1.1.4. Is the project covering the appropriate leadership and media messaging themes and providing resources and capacity enhancement that would not otherwise happen? | Descriptive | Non-experimental, one-shot | KII, Training participants, partners lead |
| 1.1.5. Has this initiative added value and bridged any technical gaps in the skills of women politicians in Pakistan? Please give some examples. | Descriptive | Non-experimental, one-shot | KII, Training participants, partners lead |
| 1.1.6. What are the perceptions of your partners and beneficiaries on various project components and their mode of delivery? | Descriptive | Non-experimental, one-shot | KII, Training participants, partners lead |
| 1.1.7. What was the level of your participation and engagement in design of the project? | Descriptive | Non-experimental, one-shot | KII, Training participants, partners lead, review |
| 1.1.8. Do you think there could have been a better alternative program design than this? | Descriptive | Non-experimental, one-shot | KII, Training participants, partners lead, Review |
| 2. Effectiveness | | | |
| 2.1.1. What are the major outputs and outcomes of the project? | Descriptive | Non-experimental, one-shot | KII, partners lead, review, SFCG leads |

| Question | Type | Design | Techniques |
|---|-------------|----------------------------|---|
| 2.1.2. How has the project contributed in promoting inclusive culture among political parties and other formal and informal institutions? Have there been any signals towards this? | Descriptive | Non-experimental, one-shot | KII, Training participants, partners lead, review |
| 2.1.3. To what extent has the project been successful in positively shifting public awareness, attitude and perceptions about the role of women politicians/parliamentarians? | Descriptive | Non-experimental, one-shot | KII, Training participants, partners lead, review |
| 2.1.4. Are there any signals of increased inclusion of women leaders in decision-making processes at all levels? | Descriptive | Non-experimental, one-shot | KII, partners lead, review, SFCG leads |
| 2.1.5. Has this project resulted in collaboration across party lines between women politicians? | Descriptive | Non-experimental, one-shot | KII, partners lead, review, SFCG leads |
| 2.1.6. What major factors are contributing to the achievement or non-achievement of objectives? | Descriptive | Non-experimental, one-shot | KII, partners lead, review, SFCG leads |
| 2.1.7. Has this project achieved its goal of increasing the capacity of women parliamentarians (2008-2013) and aspiring women politicians, by magnifying their voices and increasing their engagement in the decision-making processes? | Descriptive | Non-experimental, one-shot | KII, partners lead, review, SFCG leads |
| 2.1.8. What capacity building measures, including trainings, have been taken to ensure that the partners' project staff delivers the planned outputs effectively? | Descriptive | Non-experimental, one-shot | KII, partners lead, review, SFCG leads |
| 2.1.9. Is there more capacity-building to be done? | Descriptive | Non-experimental, one-shot | KII, partners lead, review, SFCG leads |
| 2.1.10. Are you satisfied that those measures have resulted in the skills being raised to the necessary levels? | Descriptive | Non-experimental, one-shot | KII, partners lead, review, SFCG leads |
| 2.1.11. Has this project enabled women politicians to talk about women issues as a collective | Descriptive | Non-experimental, | KII, partners lead, review, |

| Question | Type | Design | Techniques |
|---|-------------|----------------------------|--|
| body across party lines? | | one-shot | SFCG leads |
| 2.1.12. What are the strengths and challenges that the project faced during its implementation? | Descriptive | Non-experimental, one-shot | SFCG leads |
| 3. Efficiency- What is the project's operational efficiency in terms of cost-effectiveness and use of resources with added focus on the role of partners? | | | |
| 3.1.1. Did you face any operational challenge(s) during the implementation of this training program? | Normative | Non-experimental, one-shot | KII, partners lead, review, SFCG leads |
| 3.1.1.1 How efficiently were the project training resources mobilized and used during the implementation phase? | Descriptive | Non-experimental, one-shot | KII, partners lead, review, SFCG leads |
| 3.1.2. How effective were the institutional arrangements for the implementation of the program, with the focus on roles and responsibilities of SFCG and partners? | Descriptive | Non-experimental, one-shot | KII, partners lead, review, SFCG leads |
| 3.1.3. Did the reported figures by implementing partners meet all indicators identified in the log frames? | Normative | Non-experimental, one-shot | KII, partners lead, review, SFCG leads |
| 3.1.4. What was the quality of program monitoring and its role in improving program delivery? | Descriptive | Non-experimental, one-shot | KII, partners lead, review, SFCG leads |
| 4. Impacts | | | |
| 4.1.1. Has the project been successful in transferring enough knowledge and skills to the participants to ensure effective and independent application of those skills in the future? | Descriptive | Non-experimental, one-shot | KII, partners lead, review, SFCG leads |
| 4.1.2. How has the project contributed to improving the capacity of women politicians in Pakistan? How has SFCG's engagement with women politicians translated into positive action or improvements in the position of women politicians in the public space? | Descriptive | Non-experimental, one-shot | KII, partners lead, review, SFCG leads |

| Question | Type | Design | Techniques |
|---|-------------|----------------------------|--|
| 4.1.3. What change has taken place in the media's approach (overall and participating media) to women politicians as a result of this project? Has the projection of women politicians in the media improved as a result of this project? | Descriptive | Non-experimental, one-shot | KII, partners lead, review, SFCG leads |
| 4.1.4. Are there any unintended positive or negative results of this work in Pakistan? | Descriptive | Non-experimental, one-shot | KII, partners lead, review, SFCG leads |
| 4.1.5. How has the Pakistani media (radio?) benefitted from the SFCG's work through this project and how are they magnifying the knowledge beyond the project activities? | Descriptive | Non-experimental, one-shot | KII, partners lead, review, SFCG leads |
| 4.1.6. What changes have been seen in the dealings of the media professionals i.e., radio producers/talk show hosts after attending trainings? | Descriptive | Non-experimental, one-shot | KII, partners lead, review, SFCG leads |
| 4.1.7. What changes have been seen in the media handling practices/strategies of the women politicians? | Descriptive | Non-experimental, one-shot | KII, partners lead, review, SFCG leads |

4. EVALUATION FINDINGS

Main results from data gathering and analysis, structured according to the evaluation criteria and main evaluation questions, defined in the Terms of Reference are given below:

RELEVANCE: 4

RATHER HIGH (THE INTERVENTION BRINGS GOOD RESULTS BUT THERE ARE NEGATIVE EXTERNAL FACTORS)

PROGRAM DESIGN AND IMPLEMENTATION

Program design remains relevant to the needs and the context of the political sphere in Pakistan that allows women leaders and parliamentarians to contribute to the socio economic fabric. The majority of women participants in the trainings shared that the program design was relevant to their needs. However, there are hardly any instances where participants or the partners or SFCG's teams shared any example about community participation during program design.

- WILL program's structure provide an opportunity to the women's leaders, parliamentarians, councilors and others to interact with each other, with other parties and with the media and community. This opportunity, however, had been limited before the project, making it challenging for them to respond to queries or to contact the media themselves.
- It is clear from the discussions held during the evaluation process that the participant's selection was made without a documented inclusion criteria from mainstream parties i.e. PPP, PMLN, PTI, MQM and others. The whole process was driven by the guidelines written in the project proposal document, which was created with little consultation of target populations. The knowledge acquired by the project participants in the previous trainings they had attended meant that the SFCG leadership-training program was based on a "common ground" of awareness and knowledge, for the participants who had been elected previously.
- The training facilitators during the implementation phase of the program brought in examples of content from Pakistan. The content was almost entirely experiential, rather than using an "academic" slide-lecture approach, which meant that local knowledge could be brought to bear. Also, the lessons and conclusions from the various parts of the training were drawn from the participants, rather than being devised or imposed by an outsider. This resulted in leadership "from the inside out", which was appropriate in terms of the expressed perceptions of the project participants.
- When asked about the usefulness of the radio programs, the radio presenters said that they found that such programs are important for awareness raising and they play a key role in influencing public opinion. They said that in the context of widespread power cuts in the country, radio remains an effective way to reach large numbers of people in both urban and rural areas. They also felt that programs focusing on issues that are important to women and men, and that focus on women's public and domestic roles, can help to change societal perspectives of the role of women in politics.⁶
- The Master Trainers, FGD participants and the SFCG Leadership and Training Director, all said that the training sessions should have been longer. They indicated that neither one-day for the MPAs nor two days for the district participants was enough for building rapport and engaging in the experiential activities. Nor was the seven-day Training of Trainers (ToT) long enough to cover everything to the desired depth. Therefore the effectiveness of the training went below par.
- Around thirty eight per cent of the women interviewed use social media. They have either set the up accounts themselves or their adult children have done so, but the women

⁶ References from Mid-term Evaluation

leaders use these forums to remain in touch with (i) other women in their parties, (ii) people in their constituencies and in some cases with the NGOs with which they either volunteer or are employed. They are thus able to access the project website and Facebook page, and to refer their political and other colleagues and other to the sites. This has the advantage of informing a wide audience about the project.

- More than sixty percent of the training participants shared that the program was relevant and that it had given them a great sense of awareness and relevant information. Moreover, fifty four percent women respondents (training participants) shared that this program had improved their leadership skills. The coaching activities can be said to have been relevant to the beneficiaries' needs for information (for example on leadership qualities) and support (for example, when they encountered conflicts and wanted to discuss ways to resolve problems).
- Only six respondents had taken advantage of the coaching sessions (although in the course of the project the Insan Foundation Trust and PAIMAN both conducted 120 sessions (totaling 240 sessions). The women who had participated in the coaching sessions responded that they were very appreciative of the fact that the coaching was available and said that they had found it useful.

EFFICIENCY: 3

MEDIUM (THE PROCEDURES, RESULTS OR ASSUMPTIONS SOMEWHAT MEET THE EXPECTATIONS)

WILL program started back in September 2011 all three partners (PAIMAN, INSAN and Uks) were selected in quarter one of 2012. Selection of political parties was made without documented criteria although all mainstream political parties were selected. There were clearly inclusion and exclusion errors.

PAIMAN implemented the training in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KP) and Baluchistan and parts of Sindh, has been training women in governance since 2006 and the Executive Director of PAIMAN has been engaged in training women on issues related to governance since the late 1980s and particularly with women parliamentarians (Provincial and National) since 2001. Uks is unique in the NGO sector in Pakistan in its focus is on women in the media. Co-authorship of UKs with SFCG of the Media Messaging Manual has produced good media resources that could be useful for a long time. Likewise Insan Foundation, implemented training sessions in Sindh and Punjab, has good connections with the media and with the Provincial Assembly members. It has been “working since 1992 in the field of peace, democracy and rights of women and children”. These institutional links through SFCG partners helped to bring Parliamentarians to the training events.

How effective were the institutional arrangements for the implementation of the program, with the focus on roles and responsibilities of SFCG and partners?

Consortium approach was designed in a way that each partner signed an independent agreement with SFCG.

Any operational challenge(s) during the implementation of this training program?

There were quite a number of challenges during the implementation of the program.

- It was noted by the SFCG Finance Manager that not all of the partners had the capacity to spend the allocated funds within the agreed time frames. SFCG’s flexibility and understanding of difficulties beyond the implementing partners’ control (for example when threats to security made it impossible for the women to move about safely) were appreciated by the partners. The SFCG Pakistan Finance Manager supported the partners in strengthening their financial systems for this project and aligning those systems with each other so that all partners could report efficiently. SFCG Pakistan thus functioned as a helpful and effective “bridge” between SFCG, the partners and DRL.
- The partners implementing the training and leadership programs, for their part, indicated that funds had been transferred on time and that the program management, including

fund transfers, had been efficient. The exception is *Uks*, which was less than satisfied with both the funding amounts and the choice of locations for the media events, indicating that the latter was not ideal, in comparison with the locations for the leadership events. However, since the partners were responsible for managing the events, including the choice of venue, the responsibility for this lies with the partner.

- Another major factor that had to be addressed by the project team was the timing of political events: primarily the May 2013 General Election, which preoccupied those women running for office as MPAs. The security situation (i.e. suicide bombings and target killings) made it difficult for participants to attend some events and often, politicians were the targets of these attacks (e.g. as noted in the *Uks* Fourth Quarterly Report). Several MPAs included in the mid-term evaluation noted that their parties' demands on their time – and their election campaigns - had to take precedence over project activities.
- Even without such major problems, organizing the required project events was a complex matter, since it required coordinating the schedules of the individual Provincial Assembly members with the schedules of the Councilors. These are all women who are busy with political party and community commitments, as well as familial responsibilities.
- In terms of budget allocations both the SFCG Pakistan Finance Manager and the partners agreed that the donor, the Bureau of Democracy, Human Rights and Labor of the United States Department of State, had been provided sufficient funding to meet program needs and was flexible in adapting to evolving circumstances and making budgetary adjustments based on expressed needs. Rigorous accounting systems are in place and SFCG provided assistance to some of the partners in bringing their financial systems in line with the donor requirements.
- PAIMAN expressed some frustration with the leadership training manual, since, they said, the organization was not allowed to adapt the manual once it had been approved. PAIMAN also indicated that, from its perspective, the manual was less than ideal because it lacked content on governance, caucus building, ways of raising issues in Parliament, how to align with male politicians, pro-gender legislation and “how women should carry themselves as leaders”. However, the purpose of the leadership training sessions was to build skills related to conflict recognition, analysis and resolution, rather than the points raised by PAIMAN.
- *Uks* was pleased with the outcomes of the innovative radio program training, which brought together Pakistan Broadcasting Corporation and private FM producers and presenters. Some “mock programs’ were produced which integrated a gender-specific focus. SFCG Pakistan provided useful guidelines for the training.
- In terms of consortium coordination *Uks* expressed some dissatisfaction with what they felt were unrealistic requirements to arrange events on short notice from SFCG.

Specifically, they were dependent on PAIMAN for lists of participants, which were sometimes incomplete and required what *Uks* considered to be a lengthy and complex confirmation process.

- Organizing the training events, in general, was a complex matter for everyone involved, since it required coordinating the schedules of the individual Provincial Assembly members with the schedules of the Councilors, all of them women who are busy with political and community issues. However, it was managed reasonably by all partners, as evidenced by the satisfaction of all the partners interviewed.
- Baluchistan is confronted with ethnic violence hence posing threat for any external intervention or activity. Despite the challenging situation the 2nd Women Leadership Forum was organized when the security situation of Baluchistan became better.
- Elections 2013 and its campaigning period delayed many pre-planned activities as implementing partners were unable to seek availability of the participating women. Due to their heavy involvement in the election it was very difficult to make parliamentarians and councilors available for this forum. However, with constant coordination it was made possible. To address this challenge in the best possible manner, while recording for the WILL radio talk shows, beneficiaries were made part of the program through live call-ins.
- Due to the unstable security situation in Karachi caused by the city's shutdown in protest of the Abbas Town sectarian attacks, the First National Networking Summit was postponed at the last minute. Instead, the first Leadership Forum was organized instead, utilizing the available participants and resources.
- The first quarter of 2015 has been a challenging one for Pakistan, particularly in terms of the political situation in Sindh. This has had a direct impact on the program deliverables as the training that was initially planned for April was unable to go as planned.
- The targeted operation carried out by the Rangers at Nine-Zero, the headquarters of the Muttahida Qaumi Movement (MQM) in Karachi, led to the arrest of several leaders and a province wide strike which lead to postponement of examinations and closure of business in major cities particularly in lower Sindh.

How efficiently were the project training resources mobilized and used during inception and implementation phase?

The project aimed to strengthen the capacities of women MPAs for policy consensus building and legislation, through a set of intensive training workshops. In addition to strengthening their leadership skills, participants increased their knowledge of parliamentary rules of business and legislative processes.

- In terms of the quality of the communication, the partners felt that on some occasions the communication with SFCG could have been improved. For example, PAIMAN mentioned that they were not initially informed about the Insan Foundation’s role in the project.
- The partners and some of the Master Trainers felt that more inter-partner meetings at the inception stage would have enabled them to know each other better and to acquire a deeper understanding of the aspects of the project. The partners’ participation in consortium meetings and the initiative was rather inconsistent, which led to some issues in co-ordination and less than ideal across-the-board co-operation. One meeting was held during the inception phase and two further all-partner consortium meetings had taken place. The idea for more meetings was an indication of the desire for more interaction to achieve better mutual understanding. No specific numbers for additional meetings were suggested.
- The evaluators note that any effort to create and maintain a consortium – ideally a partnership of equals on a common ground brought together to meet project goals and objectives – can be difficult. Having years of experience and deep expertise do not necessarily mean being willing to “buy in” to a project’s concepts and practices. Achieving synergies (i.e. something that is more than the sum of the parts) in addition to achieving objectives and targets is even more difficult, as was indicated by SFCG. Despite the difficulties, the consortium has worked to accomplish the objectives and meet the targets.

EFFECTIVENESS: 5

HIGH (THE OBJECTIVES ARE MET AND THERE IS AN OVERALL SATISFACTION WITH THE INTERVENTION)

What were the major outputs and outcomes of the project?

Most women participants of the training program shared that training program has given them a good sense of awareness about socio-political system in Pakistan’s parliamentary political fabric. Two women parliamentarians from Federally Administrative Areas of Pakistan (FATA) and Khyber Pakhtunkhwa shared that women are discouraged to make independent decisions, therefore, this program has given them a good platform to understanding how critical their role could be in the political system.

- Trainers were well versed and training material was translated into local languages. This was important because some training participants were more comfortable using their local language rather than English. The training was therefore inclusive and made it possible for everyone present to be actively involved.

- Generally, 95% of the training participants and interviewees were very positive towards the project. As noted in examples, they consistently said that the events had added to their confidence, their leadership and advocacy skills and to their ability to address conflicts of various kinds. Some noted that the trainings had enhanced their sense of having the right to engage in political activities.
- Out of total 128 MPAs, the project trained 64%, which is 23.7% of those in Punjab, 53% of those in Sindh, 52% of those in Baluchistan and 69% of those in KP. This can be considered a “critical mass” of women MPAs who have been exposed to the project’s ideas and who have made commitments to the objectives of strengthening women leaders’ voices.
- Majority of the training participants shared that training had added to their previous knowledge, the respondents, without exception, agreed that the trainings and leadership forums had enhanced their knowledge, especially in conflict resolution and in their capacity to interact with the media. A Master Trainer who had attended the ToT termed both the trainer and the contents of the training “excellent”. The other Trainers (50% of them) were also positive in their assessment.

Has this project achieved its goal of increasing the capacity of women parliamentarians (2008-2015) and aspiring women politicians, by magnifying their voices and increasing their engagement in the decision-making processes?

- The participants appreciated meeting prominent women in politics, mentioning especially Dr. Fehmida Mirza, Pakistan’s first woman Speaker of the National Assembly and Dr Ayesha Siddiqua, a noted scholar. Since an important element of the SFCG approach had been to ensure that District and Provincial level politicians, both elected and aspiring, be brought together, the respondents’ appreciation of this confirms its value.
- Women respondents cited numerous instances of increased personal confidence that has helped them deal with matters within the Women’s Wings of their parties, with their parties at large and with the media, all of which are indicators of successful and sustainable project outcomes. A local government elect from MQM in Karachi specifically highlighted her renewed confidence in being able to tackle issues and share her opinion on important matters following her attendance of the capacity building training in Sindh, something her party leaders had also noticed. She also shared that her party was keen to ensure that more members attend the WILL training to be able to benefit in the same way that she had.
- Participants shared that they were learning to handle things on their own rather than relying on men; mediating disputes over the future of young women; and helping girls to stay in school. One MPA also formed a Conflict Resolution Committee, consisting of both men and women members, and has written a letter to the Chief Minister of KP requesting that a 10% quota be constituted in employing women in Government service. Another FGD

participant mentioned that she had travelled to Nepal on a journey with women from several major NGOs. Another participant said that she and her colleagues have progressed from being “workers” to being leaders. These are examples of exposure to programs that build the confidence to accept opportunities that can change their lives.⁷

- It cannot be over-emphasized that the kind of positive public discourse on women politicians produced by the media stream of the project is largely absent in Pakistan, which makes the contributions described here both unique and very valuable. It relates to the general observations that women capacity in media management and positive contribution towards parliamentary democracy in Pakistan is below par. The program has encouraged women leaders to step up and participate in current affairs through media campaigns and play a proactive role in shifting the perception of women politicians.
- In Karachi, forty percent of the participants mentioned that they are now able to interact with the police, which is an indication of their empowerment, as it links them to the legal system. The movement from inability to ability, with its attendant concept of entitlement, is significant for all of the women, especially since some of the ex-Councilors are not literate.
- Three out of 30 women noted that they must deal with the fact that there is a tribal and feudal society and that these factors limit their ability to function as politicians. They found the “group activities and learning opportunities to be excellent”, and felt the training had strengthened their determination to overcome these difficulties.

Are there any signals of increased inclusion of women leaders in decision-making processes at all levels?

- Almost all respondents in all provinces said that their ability to deal with the community level decision-making has improved. For example, the women interviewed in Karachi said that their ability to speak in public had increased, following the media training sessions and that has significantly impacted their decision-making. While most examples given detailed more positive and effective relations with the media, one participant said she had endured a conflict with a newspaper and had had the confidence to sue a newspaper for publishing a false story about her, which indicated that women leaders are empowered to challenge the media for securing justice.
- PAIMAN had been involved in formulating the initial project and had expected that the training content would build directly on (i.e. would add to) the content of previous trainings held by the UNDP and NGOs, including PAIMAN, since the year 2000. However, the SFCG

⁷ Mid Line Report

team noted that the focus of the project was on conflict resolution, advocacy and consensus building, rather than on the subjects covered in previous training courses. The media partner *Uks* expressed the idea that the consortium could have allowed more “space” for the partners’ own ideas to be expressed, although it was part of the SFCG methodology to include partners and beneficiaries (including the media participants) in the design.

- Media talk shows and campaigns remained quite effective. SFCG Pakistan along with its partner *Uks* has broadcasted 150 WILL Radio Talk shows on 30 Radio stations. The programs aimed to empower women leaders to continue their work as politicians in their respective constituencies and sensitized their male counterparts and the general public to give them respect and the necessary space to continue their work.
- A number of female members of parliament were invited as guests on the radio shows to talk about their political parties and stressed men to engage women in politics while treating them equal to men. The participants highlighted the significance of acceptance and tolerance in order to make this country prosperous. The programs gave a message that it is the role of political parties, male politicians and civil societies to create awareness among people to engage women in the national discourse as they constitute 51% of the country’s population and democracy cannot be successful without including women in matters of the State. The guests discussed different ways of creating awareness on the cause of engaging women in politics.⁸

How have partners perceived the project design and activities?

- The project adapted well to the evolving political and security scenarios. Some of these factors were foreseen in the TNA (including the general election) but the dangers of bombings and target killings were unpredictable. The 18th Amendment to the Constitution, which transferred many powers from the Federal to the Provincial Governments and the May 2013 General Election, also required adjustments of the schedule. The Insan Foundation Trust office in Rawalpindi was attacked when the SFCG project had just begun, and the organization had to find a new office, which led to some difficulties although no major changes in the schedule of events.⁹
- The Insan Foundation was positive about the methods and the *Uks* Master Trainer interviewed considered the ToT to have been excellent. The SFCG monitoring reports from the training sessions indicate that all of the participants had fully participated in the techniques and had enjoyed doing so. In the evaluation FGDs and interviews the

⁸ 7th Quarterly report

⁹ 8th Quarterly report

participants recalled that they had enjoyed the teaching methods and had learned useful lessons from them. The women leaders interviewed recalled the names of specific techniques such as the “Consensus Knot” and the “Orange Negotiation” and were enthusiastic about what they had learned about the context of conflicts, how to analyze conflicts and leadership. The Insan Foundation also shared that they use these techniques in other projects where it is relevant to help convey concepts of leadership and conflict resolution.

- *Uks* had initially found it difficult to convince experienced radio producers to take part in a “learning circle” or to convince them that an extended discussion of gender and media issues (e.g. harassment, isolation, hierarchies and patriarchy and the lack of funds for women politicians) was necessary. However, ultimately the required level of involvement was achieved, as expressed in the opinion of the *Uks* staff and by Mr. Kashif Rana, one of the media Master Trainers interviewed during the MTE.¹⁰

IMPACT: 5

HIGH (THE OBJECTIVES ARE MET AND THERE IS AN OVERALL SATISFACTION WITH THE INTERVENTION)

Has the project been successful in transferring enough knowledge and skills to the participants to ensure effective and independent application of those skills in the future?

A number of changes have been observed as a result of the WILL program. One of the key milestones of this program to support women leaders would remain the development of the guidebook for women parliamentarians. This comprehensive and objective document explains the political history, women’s role (globally, nationally and regionally) in parliamentary systems and has been endorsed by the Speaker of the National Assembly. Copies of the guidebook are also available in the official library of the National Assembly.

The guidebook draws on SFCG’s global and regional expertise in strengthening women’s political leadership skills by supporting participants to develop and utilize skills in legislative and constitutional procedures, development frameworks, women’s political reforms agenda, best practices on building alliances and networks, parliamentary caucus, and building positive public perception through effective media management. Covering key subjects – such as the historical emancipation of women, political struggles in Pakistan, fear of public speaking, collaborating with women parliamentarians across party lines, engaging media, as well as personal leadership

¹⁰ Mid Term Review Report

attributes –In Pakistan, where the leadership of women is not a learnt behavior, this manual serves as a useful tool for women political leaders.¹¹

- Slightly over 95% of the training participants and interviewees were very positive in their response to the project. As noted in examples, they consistently said that the events had added to their confidence, their leadership and advocacy skills and to their ability to address conflicts of various kinds. Some noted that the trainings had enhanced their sense of having the right to engage in political activities.
- Sixty six percent of the women respondents from different political parties shared that beside other learning benefits, WILL as brought major political parties together and now we can see a great culture of inclusiveness among the parties.¹²
- The WILL campaign that grew in the second phase of the project, also contributed to ensuring that learning continues. The video documentary was also shown in many political and social forums that carry the message that women politicians and leaders were willing and able to respond to constituents’ needs. The WILL Facebook page has also been an excellent medium for raising issues pertaining to women and for sharing good practices.
- Interview respondents noted that a number of prominent politicians are WILL ambassadors, including the Honorable former Speaker of the House. Ample knowledge on the part of the project participants, especially at the District level, has yet to be achieved, in part because some of the women leaders do not use the Internet or have sufficient access to it.
- Achieving the goals for the campaign – “to work with social change enablers” and to function as a “social compass” - will require more time.

5. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

- a) There were hardly any instances where participants shared any example about community participation during program design. Therefore, one of the key recommendations under the program design phase is to engage with civil society, women leaders and women representatives from community.
- b) It was clear during the exercise that the participant’s selection was made randomly from mainstream parties i.e. PPP, PMLN, PTI, MQM and others. There was no documented inclusion or exclusion criteria with the program management as such. The entire process of selection was driven from program proposal document that somehow affected the overall representation of political parties. It is therefore recommended to have a clear documented selection criteria.

¹¹ A guidebook for women political leaders

¹² Analysis of consolidated Responses from the training participants

- c) It was noted by the SFCG Finance Manager that not all of the partners had the capacity to spend the allocated funds within the agreed time frames. SFCG's flexibility and understanding of difficulties beyond the implementing partners' control (for example when threats to security made it impossible for the women to move about safely) were appreciated by the partners. There were efforts from SFCG to build capacity of partners on financial management but structured capacity building through out the life of program could have been more effective.
- d) The funds transfer remained reasonably efficient but Uks, which was less than satisfied with both the funding amounts and the choice of locations for the media events, indicating that the latter were not ideal, in comparison with the locations for the leadership events. This compels to the recommendation that consultative process on financial engagement could have been made more effective and thereby should have been documented before signing the MOUs with partners.
- e) The 2013 General Election preoccupied those women running for office as MPAs. The security situation made it difficult for participants to attend some events and often, politicians were the targets of some attacks (e.g. as noted in the Uks Fourth Quarterly Report). Several MPAs included in the mid-term evaluation noted that their parties' demands on their time – and their election campaigns - had to take precedence over project activities. A comprehensive risk analysis would help to improve how such unavoidable delays can be handled more efficiently.
- f) One of the partners felt that on some occasions the communication with SFCG could have been improved. For example they were not initially informed about the Insan Foundation's role in the project therefore it's critical to have clear scope of work and mandate to operate in a complex consortium setting. The development of a mutually agreed schedule of progress review meetings during a kick-off meeting would help minimize communication gaps.
- g) The partner's participation in consortium meetings and the initiative was rather inconsistent, which led to some issues in co-ordination and less than ideal across-the-board co-operation. It is the case that one meeting during the inception phase and further all-partner consortium meetings had taken place. The idea for more meetings was an indication of the desire for more interaction to achieve better mutual understanding. Any effort to create and maintain a consortium – ideally a partnership of equals on a common ground brought together to meet project goals and objectives – can be difficult. Having years of experience and deep expertise do not necessarily mean being willing to 'buy in' to a project's concepts and practices. Achieving synergies (i.e. something that is more than the sum of the parts) in addition to achieving objectives and targets is even more difficult, as was indicated by SFCG.

- h) Media talk shows were effective in engaging with the political leaders however it would be have been beneficial to include those sessions in the second phase of the project as well.

Annex A

Terms of Reference for Final Evaluation

“Strengthening Women Parliamentarians in Pakistan for Effective Government”

I. Introduction

SEARCH FOR COMMON GROUND (SFCG) IS AN INTERNATIONAL PEACEBUILDING ORGANIZATION THAT STRIVES TO TRANSFORM THE WAY THE WORLD DEALS WITH CONFLICT, AWAY FROM ADVERSARIAL APPROACHES AND TOWARDS COLLABORATIVE PROBLEM SOLVING. SFCG IS WORKING IN 39 COUNTRIES ACROSS AFRICA, ASIA, THE MIDDLE EAST, CENTRAL ASIA AND THE USA. SFCG WORKS WITH GOVERNMENTS, CIVIL SOCIETY, STATE INSTITUTIONS, SECURITY SECTORS, RELIGIOUS LEADERS, EDUCATIONAL INSTITUTIONS, YOUTH, MEDIA ORGANIZATIONS AND OTHER STAKEHOLDER GROUPS TO PROMOTE PEACE, TOLERANCE AND COLLABORATION ACROSS DIVIDING LINES.

SFCG began its programs in Pakistan in 2010 where it has a long-term commitment to:

- Promote a national culture and processes for peacebuilding across dividing lines;
- Increase the participation of youth and women in active citizenship and leadership for peacebuilding;
- Strengthen state institutions for post-conflict transformative rule of law and service delivery for social cohesion and protection; and
- Enhance the role of media to create social sensitivity and national harmony through responsible reporting and collaborative outreach.

II. Background

IN 2013, SFCG WAS AWARDED THE TWO-YEAR “STRENGTHENING WOMEN PARLIAMENTARIANS IN PAKISTAN FOR EFFECTIVE GOVERNMENT” PROJECT BY THE U.S. STATE DEPARTMENT, BUREAU OF DEMOCRACY, HUMAN RIGHTS AND LABOR (DRL). THIS PROJECT WAS GIVEN THE BRAND NAME WILL (WOMEN’S INITIATIVE FOR LEARNING AND LEADERSHIP) BY SFCG. SFCG along with its local partners built the capacity of women political leaders and providing continued leadership development for current and former women parliamentarians at the provincial levels as well as politicians at the district level. Program trainings, coaching sessions, networking platforms and leadership forums aimed at increasing their capacity to build coalitions and strategic consensus with likeminded individuals and organizations. The project also utilized popular media in an attempt to shift attitudes toward women’s participation in government. Media activities included message development, stakeholder meetings, common ground workshops, developing and handling of publicity and promotion of a nationwide campaign, and interactive talk shows.

BUILDING ON WILL’S SUCCESSES ACHIEVED IN THE LAST TWO YEARS, SFCG BEGAN IMPLEMENTING THE SECOND PHASE OF WILL BEGINNING OCTOBER 2013. WILL’s second phase aimed to strengthen the leadership capacities of women parliamentarians (MPs) in the Provincial Assemblies, their male counterparts and government officials from Punjab and Sindh provinces in order to increase their influence in decision-making and effective governance. More specifically, it draws on SFCG’s experience and networks in the Punjab and Sindh provinces, as well as on its global expertise in strengthening women’s political leadership skills by supporting participants to develop and utilize skills in community mobilization, dialogue and negotiation, capacity building, and media engagement. It also harnesses its partners’ locally rooted experience working with the target groups of the initiative. Through a multi-pronged approach, WILL engages key stakeholders to shape national solidarity and establish mechanisms for greater participation of women in politics and policy-



making. WILL aims to create a transformative experience of negotiation, collaboration, and effecting change for women MPs using SFCG's well-tested Common Ground Approach (CGA)¹³ that can translate their commitment to democratic governance in Pakistan through policy reform and implementation.

iii. Project Objectives

THE OVERALL PROJECT GOAL IS TO STRENGTHEN THE ROLE OF WOMEN PARLIAMENTARIANS (MPS) IN THE PROVINCIAL ASSEMBLIES IN A WAY THAT INCREASES THEIR INFLUENCE IN DECISION-MAKING FOR EFFECTIVE GOVERNANCE.

SPECIFIC OBJECTIVES INCLUDE THE FOLLOWING:

- TO INCREASE THE LEADERSHIP SKILLS OF WOMEN PARLIAMENTARIANS (MPS) FOR EFFECTIVE POLICY-MAKING AND REFORM;
- TO FACILITATE THE CREATION OF POLICY MECHANISMS THAT ENABLE WOMEN PARLIAMENTARIANS (MPS) TO COLLABORATE ACROSS PARTY LINES WITH THEIR MALE COUNTERPARTS AND GOVERNMENT OFFICIALS; AND
- TO BUILD POSITIVE PUBLIC PERCEPTION AROUND THE ROLE OF WOMEN PARLIAMENTARIANS (MPS) AS EFFECTIVE LEADERS AND DECISION-MAKERS THROUGH MEDIA SENSITIZATION.

In order to increase the capacity of women parliamentarians as well as former and aspiring women councilors by magnifying women's voices and bolstering engagement in decision making at the provincial and local levels, the project set the following broader results.

- Elected women parliamentarians and former and aspiring women councilors are equipped with coalition and consensus building skills and are able to advocate more effectively for a variety of issues, including women specific issues;
- Trainers/facilitators from national women's organizations are empowered as agents of reform and change and provide effective political leadership training at provincial and local levels in Pakistan
- The population's awareness and perception of the role of women politicians as effective decision-makers in government is improved.

The direct beneficiaries of the project are our local partners, provincial women parliamentarians, and former and aspiring women councilors at the district level across Pakistan.

iv. Project Activities

The project will use a people-to-people approach by engaging a target group of 110 project beneficiaries including 77 women politicians (MPs and District Level Women Politicians); 33 male politicians; and 22 government officials who have the potential and position to influence policy reforms. It will include four distinct project phases that include the following:

¹³The Common Ground Approach is a means of navigating through conflict and identifying possibilities that are not apparent from an adversarial mindset. It is a set of principles and practices that, when utilized, causes a fundamental shift in people's relationship with conflict--away from adversarial approaches toward cooperative solutions. The Common Ground Approach--whether applied in a home in the suburbs of New York City, on the streets of inner city Cincinnati, or between ethnic groups in the Balkans or Buner (FATA)--creates new possibilities of peaceful coexistence. The Common Ground Approach is derived from over three decades of practical experience--it has been crafted by what works.

1. Baseline and Political Needs Assessment on Women Parliamentarians
2. Capacity-building/Leadership Development for Policy-making and Networking: i) Training Modules and Manuals; ii) Training of Trainers (ToT)
3. Provincial Trainings: i) Capacity-building/Leadership Development for Policy-making and Networking
4. Stakeholder Dialogues to Create Collaborative Mechanisms in Provincial Assemblies: i) Provincial policy dialogues; ii) National dialogue summit
5. Media Outreach and Communications for Positive Portrayal of and Support for Women Parliamentarians: i) Media outreach campaign

v. Evaluation Objectives

The Final Evaluation will be designed to assess the overall approach, using a “theory-based evaluation” framework. While the evaluator may suggest which specific approach to adopt, SFCG recommends adopting a Theory of Change approach. The theory of change of this project is implicit within the design, and will have to be explicitly identified by the evaluator at the start of the evaluation.

Additionally, the evaluation will measure how the project was implemented and to what extent the project goals and objectives were achieved. The evaluation will measure how well the project responded to the needs of women parliamentarians, ex-councilors and aspiring female politicians through an assessment of relevance; measure the project’s effectiveness by assessing how well it achieved its objectives, outcomes and outputs; evaluate the program’s design, strategy and implementation strategy; and finally assess the management of the program, including the management of relationships with partner organizations

The evaluation will encompass an analysis based on the OECD-DAC criteria of evaluating peacebuilding intervention to answer some of the key questions listed in detail below.

1. Relevance/Appropriateness:

- Are the project’s stated goals and objectives relevant to the issues central to the women politicians in Pakistan? Do the activities and strategies fit project objectives?
- Is the project adding value that other actors in peacebuilding and the media in Pakistan were not previously providing?
- Is the project covering the appropriate leadership and media messaging themes and providing resources and capacity enhancement that would not otherwise happen?
- How relevant are the project strategies and activities as perceived by the beneficiaries and other community stakeholders?

2. Effectiveness:

- What are the major outputs and outcomes of the project?
- Has SFCG achieved its goal of increasing the capacity of women parliamentarians and aspiring women politicians by magnifying their voices and increasing their engagement in the decision making processes?
- How has the project contributed in promoting inclusive culture among political parties and other formal and informal institutions? Have there been any signals towards this?
- To what extent the project has been successful in positively shifting public awareness, attitude and perceptions about the role of women politicians/parliamentarians?
- Are there any signals of increased inclusion of women leaders in decision-making processes at all level?
- Has this project resulted in collaboration above party-lines between women politicians?
- What major factors are contributing to the achievement or non-achievement of objectives?

3. Intermediate Impact:

- Has the project been successful in transferring enough knowledge and skills to the participants to ensure effective and independent application of those skills in the future?
- How has the project contributed in improving the capacity of women politicians in Pakistan? How has SFCG's engagement with women politicians translated into positive action or improvements in the position of women politicians in the public space?
- What change has taken place in the media's approach (overall and participating media) to women politicians as a result of this project? Has the projection of women politicians in the media improved as a result of SFCG's work?
- Are there any unintended positive or negative results of this work in Pakistan?
- How has the Pakistani media (radio?) benefitted from the SFCG's work through this project and how are they magnifying the knowledge beyond the project activities?

vi. Evaluation Methodology

SFCG is committed to conducting the evaluation with solid methodology to measure the participation of women representing diverse political ideologies and a common platform. The methodologies will include: desk study review, key informant interviews, focus groups, and surveys:

Desk study review: Academic literature discussing women and politics in Pakistan should be reviewed. This is important for capturing and mapping women's participation in Pakistani politics at least for the last two to three local and parliamentary elections. Literature is crucial to identifying ideas that support women's participation in politics.

Key informants Interviews: Interviews will be conducted with key informants in the target areas. Women alumni of our trainings will be interviewed to capture the changes in their knowledge and skills on engaging communities and media, how they implemented the training materials for demonstrating their leadership skills. The interviews will also identify what conflicts and challenges the women alumni faced and how they solved those conflicts using training material approaches. Interviews with women alumni will also capture the stories of success and failure of women leaders while exercising their political leadership in both formal and informal structures. Members of political parties will also be interviewed to evaluate the changing perspectives of political parties in supporting women to become leaders, how the political parties developed policy to support women at different level of politics, and how the training materials and other activities impacted internal party support increased role of women in politics.

Focus Group Discussions (FGDs): At least three focus group discussions (with groups such as parliament members, former legislative candidates, religious leaders, community leaders, and constituents) will be conducted in each location to measure shifting perception and role of women in politics as well as local leaders' perception and attitude on women's role in politics.

Sample Surveys: A community-based survey will be conducted to measure the contribution of the project in shifting public perception around the role of women parliamentarians (MPs) as effective leaders and decision-makers through media sensitization. The survey data will be disaggregated by different variables such as gender, age, profession religious affiliation and state, among others.

vii. Scope of Work and Deliverables

Scope of Work

Location:



This evaluation will take place in the 2 provinces of Pakistan, Punjab and Sindh.

Deliverables:

Following specific deliverables are expected from the consultant.

Within seven days from signing the contract, the consultant will submit the Inception Report, which clearly defines the evaluation methodology, such as clear outlines of FGDs and KII checklist, survey questionnaires, and an evaluation timeline with specific deadlines for each deliverable. The inception report should also clearly explain the sampling methodology and sample size for the quantitative survey and clear and logical explanation of the number of FGDs and KIIs planned in each location. The inception report will be reviewed and approved by the SFCG Team. The evaluator cannot start the data collection process without the SFCG team's approval on the inception report.

Draft reevaluation report to be submitted within 10 days of completion of the data collection in the project sites for the review and comments from SFCG Team. The review and feedback of the report could be more than one round depending on the quality of the report submitted by the consultant and the extent to which the comments and suggestions from the first round of review have been incorporated.

The final evaluation report after incorporating the comments from SFCG. The report should be written in English language and should be around 25-30 pages (excluding annexes) in length and consists of:

- Cover Page. SFCG will provide sample cover sheet for reference.
- Table of contents, list of acronyms/abbreviations and list of tables and charts
- Executive summary of key findings and recommendations – no more than 3 pages.
- Introduction: Context analysis, project description, evaluation methodology with clear explanation of sampling, survey methodology, FGDs/KIIs participant selection and data analysis approach.
- Evaluation findings, analysis, and conclusions with associated data presented per evaluation objective and per evaluation criteria, via a reasonable balance of narrative vs. graphs and charts (mandatory).
- Recommendations for future activities/intervention. The recommendations should be forward looking and should focus on program design, planning vs implementation, implementation methodology and approach, project monitoring and evaluation system, among others. The recommendations should also be framed according to the evaluation criteria.
- Appendices, which include collected data, detailed description of the methodology with research instruments, list of interviewees, bibliography, and evaluator(s) brief biography.

The evaluator has to develop the structure of the evaluation report and get approval from the Evaluation Manager (DM&E Manager, SFCG Pakistan) before starting the report writing process as indicated in the schedule above.

It should be submitted electronically in a MS-Word document. The evaluator is responsible for English editing of the final report and should be well formatted. The report will be credited to the evaluator and will be placed in the public domain at the decision of SFCG.

The evaluator shall make a verbal presentation of the findings of the evaluation in a meeting organized by SFCG for its staff and its partners. The representative of the donor may be present in this meeting.

All handwritten and electronic transcripts of interviews and FGDs, hard copies of the survey questionnaires, any logistics taken from SFCG for the evaluation purpose and photographs taken during the evaluation should be submitted to SFCG. Further to this, all information generated during the evaluation will be the sole property of SFCG and is subject to submission to SFCG along with the final report.

viii. Evaluation Team



The evaluation team will consist of the external evaluator, the SFCG Evaluation Manager (SFCG Pakistan DM&E Coordinator) and the SFCG Asia Regional DM&E Specialist. The final evaluation will be conducted under the overall supervision of the SFCG Pakistan Executive Director.

ix. Logistical Support

SFCG will provide preparatory and logistical assistance to the evaluator, including:

- Background materials (project proposal, periodic reports, existing evaluations, etc.)
- Meetings, phone/e-mail communication with program administrators
- Identify interviewees and provide contact information
- All logistical support for the field visit, including travel cost (local as well as air travel)
- Arrange meetings and appointments with stakeholders and beneficiaries in the field (if necessary).

x. Evaluator's Role and Competencies

Evaluator's Role

The evaluation will be carried out by a single external evaluator, who will report to and work under the guidance of SFCG's DM&E Coordinator, who is also the evaluation manager for this project.

The external evaluator will:

- Identify and define evaluation priority areas, methodology and indicators;
- Design and implement data collection;
- Analyze data and findings and prepare a report;
- Write and submit a final report;
- Make a brief presentation of findings and recommendations to SFCG Indonesia and partners.

xi. Evaluator competencies

- Sound knowledge on gender issues including women in politics, particularly in the Pakistani context;
- Sound understanding of Pakistan's policy and practice around women in politics;
- Sound knowledge on program development;
- Master's degree in social science or other related fields; Candidates with degree in women's studies or peacebuilding will be given priority.
- Demonstrated technical skills in gender and peacebuilding project evaluations;
- Proficiency in written English;
- Prior experience in evaluating gender programs will be an added advantage.

A complete proposals/application should be submitted by the deadline and should include:

- Proposal (maximum 6 pages, including the methods and methodology to be adopted)
- Budget estimates and price quote

- CV
- Cover letter
- Availability
- References
- Writing sample

ANNEX B (TOOLS)

QUESTIONS FOR PARTNERS' INTERVIEWS

1. Any management hurdles in implementing the Project? (e.g. communication of concepts, funds transfer, timing of events and deadlines)
2. Have you found the consortium approach efficient? Effective? Any problems encountered?
3. Were there any hurdles in recruiting trainees? Did anyone refuse?
4. Did you have any problems getting the same participants to multiple training events?
5. Please describe the process of designing the content of the training programmes.
6. How did you monitor the training activities?
7. How many monitoring & evaluation staff do you have in your organization?
8. What was innovative about the SFCG training? (donor reports ask for this but not given)
9. How did you define "conflict" for this project? Did that definition change over the course of the training sessions?
10. Were there conflict issues you felt you could not address? (beyond the scope of the project)
11. How useful was the project TNA in designing the training? How was it useful?
12. Can we see some of the training evaluations (participants' feedback)?
13. Would you say that the training rollout was effective? (If yes, what are the indicators?)
14. If you were to design another training program in the future, with the same objectives, what issues would you address? (i.e. based on what you have learned during the activities)
15. Were you able to identify any Province (or District) specific strengths and weaknesses during the project events? (Training, Forums, coaching)? Ideas on the reasons for these?
16. What were the hardest things to convey during the project activities?
17. Was there any media coverage of the project that was not initiated by the project?
18. Which stakeholders have you interacted with on any aspect of the project?
19. Are there people you would have liked to interact with but could not? Reasons?
20. Can you give any examples of participants' increased abilities over the course of the training events? Have these been recorded anywhere?

21. To what extent would you say that the Leadership Forum objectives had been accomplished?

QUESTIONS FOR SFCG STAFF ISLAMABAD

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR

- 1) How does this project contribute to the SFCG country programme strategy?
- 2) Which Government policy on women does the Project contribute to most significantly?
- 3) As the Executive Director and the Head of Lead Consortium Organization what are the strengths of this intervention that you would like to share with us?
- 4) What bottlenecks have you and your team faced during the implementation phase?
- 5) Do you think monitoring of the on-ongoing training and media activities were good enough?
- 6) How many monitoring & evaluation staff did you have for this project?
- 7) Do you think the project has attained its planned goal? Please share examples.
- 8) Since you directly interacted with the target beneficiaries during various events, what change have you felt in their behavior and knowledge as a direct result of this intervention?
- 9) How practical is the consortium approach to implementing this project?
- 10) Do you think enough financial and human resources were allocated for the implementation of this project? Both at SFCG and at partners' offices? If you faced any challenges please share.
- 11) What was the need for WILL branding? Did it achieve its purpose?
- 12) Which part of this intervention could have been done differently?
- 13) Would you specifically like to share the learning that you emphasized, as an organizational leader shall be carried forward for implementation in the next phase?
- 14) Is there any component in the project that you thought could have been done differently?
- 15) What sustainability measures are embedded in the project, so as the provided knowledge could stay with the target beneficiaries?
- 16) Have you received any feedback on the intervention from other organizations' working in Pakistan on the same issue? Or were you (SFCG) invited in country by any institute to make presentation on this initiative?

FINANCE MANAGER

- 1) What financial management capacity building measures were taken for the partners, if any?
- 2) Did the partners for SFCG grant, manage separate bank accounts?
- 3) What anti-corruption measures, if any, were put in place?

- 4) What type of checks and balances were put in place by SFCG as lead organization for implementing partners systems?
- 5) What was the required frequency of having financial reports from the implementing partners? Were these requirements met?
- 6) What was the required frequency to do donor financial reporting?
- 7) What types of observations, if any, were received from the donor?
- 8) What were the comments of the auditors on the report? Any management letter written?
- 9) Who selected the auditors? Was it the partners, SFCG or the donor?
- 10) What were the strong points in financial management of the partners and what should have been changed?
- 11) Were there enough financial resources allocated for the project interventions? If there were any weaknesses please identify them.
- 12) Is there any particular learning that you will like to share with us?

SFCG PROJECT MANAGER (Lead)

1. Relevance

- 1) How do you think that the project's stated goals and objectives cater the needs of women politicians in Pakistan and what could have been done differently?
- 2) Has this initiative added value and bridged any technical gaps in the skills of women politicians in Pakistan? Please give some examples. What was unique about this initiative?
- 3) Had the project covered the appropriate themes in domains of leadership and media messaging and were enough time and resources provided for capacity enhancement that would not otherwise happen?
- 4) What are the perceptions of your partners and beneficiaries on various project components and their mode of delivery?
- 5) What are the major lessons learned (about project management and about leadership, conflict resolution and media messaging) from this phase of the Project. When did you learn the project was going to be extended? What learning from this phase has been carried out for phase 2?
- 6) Is there any planned activity in phase 1 that you found less useful after implementation and you did not include it in phase 2?

2. Effectiveness

- 1) To what extent have the women's leadership, conflict resolution and media messaging skills been improved after attending SFCG and its partners' trainings and events? Is there any example that a participant talked about the practical challenges that they face as women in the central body of her political party? Similarly, is there any incident quoted from the participants, where they played some role in conflict resolution?
- 2) What do you think are the outcomes of WILL talk shows and the media campaign? Have they produced the planned results? Any direct feedback you received from the audience or the partners' staff?
- 3) Have you received any information that participation of women MPAs and Ex Councilors have increased in their party decision making process as a result of SFCG initiative?
- 4) What capacity building measures, including trainings, have been taken to ensure that the partners' project staffs deliver the planned outputs effectively? Are you satisfied that those measures have resulted in the skills being raised to the necessary levels? Is there more capacity-building to be done?
- 5) Whether the project „strengthening Women Parliamentarians in Pakistan for Effective Government“ has enabled women politicians to talk about women issues as a collective body above party lines? Please share examples.
- 6) What are the strengths and challenges that project faced during its implementation?

3. Impact

- 1) Do you think that the project interventions have enabled the majority of the target beneficiaries to apply the acquired skills independently in their political career? For those who have not been able to apply their skills, what are the major reasons, and can those obstacles be addressed in Phase II?
- 2) What changes have been found in the dealings of the media professionals i.e., radio producers/talk show hosts after attending SFCG trainings? Any examples.
- 3) What changes have been found in the media handling practices/strategies of the women politicians?
- 4) Have you recorded any change in the public perception, which you can attribute as the direct result of WILL?
- 5) Do you think that SFCG intervention has brought any change in the media especially radio programmes way of handling women issues? Please share examples.

Session details - *Training Subject:* _____

Facilitator(s) name:: _____

Location: _____

Date: _____

C Composition - # of women parliamentarians' _____

For Completed by - Name: _____
organization: _____

Position in the party/or

Party Name _____

| | Questions | Yes | Some what | No | Remarks (in case of NO, please state the reasons) |
|--|---|-----|-----------|----|---|
| 1- Please use 'Y' or 'S' or 'N' against each question | | | | | |
| 1 | Is the training agenda clear and logical in its sequence? Is the amount of time allocated for the training appropriate? | | | | |
| 2 | Are the learning objectives clearly stated? | | | | |
| 3 | Is the language of instruction appropriate for the participants? (This includes the facilitator's speech and visual and written materials.) | | | | |
| 4 | Do the participants know why they will benefit from the training, i.e. "What's in it for me?" | | | | |
| 5 | Does the trainer possess strong knowledge of the subject? | | | | |
| 6 | Are participants actively participating ? | | | | |
| 7 | Does the facilitator resolve conflicts among the participants, and manage 'challenging' participants especially when participants are from different parties , effectively? | | | | |
| 8 | Is a follow-up or action plan developed at the end of the training session, with clear next steps, persons responsible, and timelines? | | | | |
| 9 | Do participants complete evaluation forms at the end of the training? | | | | |
| 10 | Has this training increased my ability to understand political concepts? | | | | |
| 11 | Has this training strengthened your ability to advocate on any matter? | | | | |

| | | | | | |
|----|--|--|--|--|--|
| 12 | Did the training sessions focus sufficiently on “effective political participation?” | | | | |
|----|--|--|--|--|--|

2- Project Related

1. Have you been involved in community as a direct result of attending the SFCG trainings?
2. Can you identify anything (three major learning) that you been able to accomplish since attending the trainings that you could not have accomplished before the trainings?
3. Which leadership skills would you say you have acquired from this project? Can you identify any leadership skills? How did you apply this skill in your personal or professional life?
4. Can you identify a specific conflict (of any kind) that you have been involved in as an MPA (or Councilor)? Will you like to share if there is some conflict still going on and what strategies you are opting to manage?
5. Even if that conflict is still ongoing, will you please describe how you used what you learned in the training to become involved in the conflict? What was the result of your involvement? (details)
6. Did the sessions take account of levels of knowledge and the political and social issues you are dealing with? (p.14 TNA mentions “sufficiently complexity”)
7. Is there an example of an intra-party conflict that the project has enabled you to engage in? If yes, what was the outcome?

CRITERIA RELATED (TO BE ADMINISTERED BY SENIOR TEAM MEMBER)

Relevance

- 7) Do you think that the project activities were related to the needs of women politicians in Pakistan? If yes How?
- 8) If NO, what could have been done differently?
- 9) How has this project help women politicians to improve their political and parliamentary knowledge and leadership skills? Please give some examples. What was unique about this project?
- 10) Had the project covered the appropriate themes in domains of leadership and media messaging and were enough time and resources provided for capacity enhancement that would not otherwise happen?

2. Effectiveness

- 7) To what extent have the women's leadership, conflict resolution and media messaging skills been improved after attending SFCG and its partners' trainings and events? Is there any example that a participant talked about the practical challenges that they face as women in the central body of her political party? Similarly, is there any incident quoted from the participants, where they played some role in conflict resolution?
- 8) Is there any evidence to show that there is increased role of those women MPAs and Ex Councilors in decision-making process within their party as a result of this initiative?
- 9) Being project participant, do you think that Strengthening Women Parliamentarians in Pakistan for Effective Government has enabled women politicians to talk about women issues as a collective body above party lines? Please share examples.

3. Impact

- 6) Do you think that the project interventions have enabled the majority of the training participants and beneficiaries to apply the acquired skills independently in their political career? For those who have not been able to apply their skills, what are the major reasons, and can those obstacles be addressed in Phase II?
 - 7) Do you think that media handling practices/strategies of the women politicians have been improved? If yes, give an example.
 - 8) Have you recorded any change in the public perception towards women politician or their leadership ability, which you can attribute as the direct result of this project?
 - 9) Do you think that this project's intervention has brought any change in the media especially radio programmes way of handling women issues? Please share examples. How has the media person/institutions participating in thus project benefited from the project initiatives
-